

**METHOD AND APPARATUS FOR USING DATA COMPRESSION AS A MEANS  
OF INCREASING BUFFER BANDWIDTH**

CROSS REFERENCE TO RELATED APPLICATIONS

5 Priority is claimed from U.S. Provisional Patent Application Serial No. 60/229,924 filed September 1, 2000, entitled "USING DATA COMPRESSION AS A MEANS OF INCREASING EFFECTIVE BUFFER BANDWIDTH" and further identified as attorney docket no. 3123-369-PROV, the disclosure of which is incorporated herein by reference in its entirety.

10 **FIELD OF THE INVENTION**

The present invention relates to computer memory controllers. In particular, the present invention relates to increasing the effective bandwidth of disk drive controllers using data compression.

**BACKGROUND OF THE INVENTION**

15 Memory controllers are a common feature in connection with computing devices. Among the functions of memory controllers are interface timing, refresh generation, arbitration and access to a memory component. Memory controllers may also allocate and control access to memory provided for the purpose of buffering data or as a data cache in connection with exchanges of data between a first interface or channel and a second

20 interface or channel.

As the clock speeds of computer processors and data busses have increased, the need for fast external memory has also increased. However, the speed of such memory has been unable to keep pace with increases in the speed of computer processors and data busses. For example, commonly available bulk memory has data rates of 100 or 133 Megabytes per

second, while processors, and other components within a typical computer have data rates of 200 Megabytes per second or more. Accordingly, external memory used to buffer data or as a data cache has become an increasingly large impediment to increased computer peripheral performance.

5           Although certain types of memory, such as SRAM, is capable of providing memory bandwidths that are closely matched to that of high speed processors, such memory is typically provided as an integral part of an associated processor. In addition, such memory is typically relatively small in capacity. Furthermore, such memory is generally considered prohibitively expensive to provide in the quantities required by a typical external memory  
10 application.

One approach to increasing the bandwidth of memory is to use memory having a data bus width that is greater than the width of the bus or busses interconnected to the memory. However, this approach results in increased cost and complexity, and can result in memory chips having an unacceptably large number of pins.

15          Memory controllers that include data compression and decompression engines and that allow data to be saved in compressed or uncompressed formats in the system memory are known. Such systems allow data to be passed among components of the system in compressed form, thereby decreasing the amount of time required to transfer the data. Such a system is discussed in U.S. Patent No. 6,173,381 (the "'381 patent"). However, the '381  
20 patent does not disclose a method and apparatus for increasing the data throughput performance of a memory controller that does not require modifications to the host computer system. Instead, the '381 patent discusses compressing data to improve the efficiency with

which that data is moved around the associated system. Accordingly, in connection with providing compressed data to a hard drive or other storage device, the '381 patent contemplates transferring that data in compressed form and storing the data on the storage device without first decompressing the data. Furthermore, the '381 patent does not

5 contemplate decompressing all compressed data read from memory associated with a disk drive controller before that data is provided to a system bus. Instead, the '381 patent discusses transferring over a system bus compressed data read from a disk drive in compressed form without first decompressing that data. Therefore, according to the '381 patent, the host system must be capable of compressing and decompressing data. In the case

10 of storing raw uncompressed data to a storage device using interchangeable media, for example, removable disk cartridges, the '381 patent requires that all hosts must have the ability to decompress data and to differentiate compressed from uncompressed data.

For the above-stated reasons, it would be desirable to provide a method and apparatus for improving the apparent bandwidth of memory used in connection with a

15 memory controller. In addition, it would be advantageous to provide a method and apparatus capable of increasing the apparent bandwidth of memory as compared to the bandwidth exhibited by such memory when used without the method and apparatus of the present invention, and that did not require modifications to the host system. Furthermore, it would be advantageous to provide a method and apparatus for increasing the apparent

20 bandwidth of memory that could be implemented within an application specific integrated circuit (ASIC) or as part of the firmware of a microprocessor. In addition, it would be advantageous to provide such a method and apparatus that are reliable in operation and that

are relatively inexpensive to implement.

## SUMMARY OF THE INVENTION

In accordance with the present invention, a method and an apparatus for increasing the effective bandwidth of memory in a device controller are provided. The present

5 invention generally allows memory to provide an increased apparent or effective bandwidth.

In particular, the method and apparatus of the present invention increase the effective or

apparent bandwidth of the memory by providing a controller that compresses data before or

while that data is written to the memory. When the compressed data is read from the

memory, the controller decompresses that data before providing it in its original form to a

10 consumer of the data.

According to one embodiment of the present invention, a method is provided for

increasing the effective bandwidth of memory associated with a device controller.

According to the method, a block of data is received from a producer of data at a controller associated with the memory. The controller compresses the data, and writes the compressed

15 data to the memory. Because the size of the data block is reduced by the compression of the data, a smaller amount of data is written to the memory than would otherwise be the case.

Accordingly, the apparent bandwidth of the memory is increased during the write operation.

When a consumer of data is ready to receive the compressed data, or when the consumer of data otherwise requests the compressed data, the compressed data is read from the memory.

20 Again, because of the size of data block is decreased as compared to its original, uncompressed form, a smaller amount of data must be read from the memory than would be the case if the data block had not been compressed. Accordingly, the apparent bandwidth of

the memory is increased during the read operation. The data is then decompressed by the controller before being provided in its original, uncompressed form, to the data consumer.

In accordance with a further embodiment of the present invention, a memory manager determines whether the received data cannot be compressed. For example, the  
5 memory manager determines whether the compression operation resulted in an expansion of the size of the data block, rather than a decrease in the size of the data block. If the compression operation resulted in an increase in the size of the data block, which would increase the amount of memory required to store the data (*i.e.*, the data is pathological), the data is written to memory in uncompressed form. With respect to data written to memory in  
10 uncompressed form, the memory controller generates a flag or otherwise causes an interrupt to allow an attribute to be set indicating that the data is not compressed.

In accordance with another embodiment of the present invention, a memory controller for use in connection with a computer storage device that is capable of increasing the effective bandwidth of associated memory is provided. The memory controller provides  
15 at least one interface for receiving or sending data. The memory controller further provides a data compression engine for compressing data received at the interface. Associated with or integral to the memory controller is memory, such as an SDRAM buffer or cache. Data received from a data producer or source is compressed by the data compression engine and is stored in the memory by a memory manager. When data stored in the memory is required at  
20 an interface of the memory controller, it is read from the memory by the memory manager, and expanded to its original form by a data decompression engine. The uncompressed data is then available to the interface interconnected to the data consumer. Because compression

of the data received from a data producer at the interface results in fewer bytes of information that must be written to and read from the memory, the effective bandwidth of the memory is increased. Furthermore, because the data compression and decompression engine or engines are capable of compressing and decompressing data faster than it can be stored in the memory, the overall bandwidth of the memory controller is increased as compared to a conventional memory controller.

Additional advantages of the present invention will become readily apparent from the following discussion, particularly when taken together with the accompanying drawings.

#### BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF THE DRAWINGS

**Fig. 1** is a block diagram depicting components of a memory controller system in accordance with the prior art;

**Fig. 2** is a block diagram depicting components of a memory controller system in accordance with an embodiment of the present invention; and

**Fig. 3** is a flow chart illustrating the operation of an embodiment of a memory controller system in accordance with the present invention.

#### DETAILED DESCRIPTION

With reference now to **Fig. 1**, a memory controller system **100** in accordance with the prior art is illustrated. The conventional memory controller system **100** generally includes a memory controller **104**, a first or host interface **108**, a second or channel interface **112**, and memory **116**. In addition, the memory controller **104** may include a memory manager **120**.

In a typical implementation of a conventional memory controller system **100**, the first interface is interconnected to a host processor **124** and to main memory **128** through a

system bus 132, and the second interface 112 is interconnected to a peripheral device 136.

In operation, the conventional memory controller system 100 receives data at one of the first or second interfaces 108 or 112 for transfer to the other of the first or second interfaces 108 or 112. If the consumer of the data or the interface 108 or 112 through which

5 the consumer of data is interconnected to the conventional memory controller 104 is not ready to receive that data, or if it is determined that the data should be cached, the memory manager 120 writes the data to the memory 116.

In a typical memory controller 104, the bandwidth of the memory 116 limits the bandwidth of the first and second interfaces 108 or 112, the memory manager 120, or the

10 bandwidth of processors or other devices interconnected to the controller 104 through the first and second interfaces 108 and 112. Therefore, data often cannot be written to or read from the memory 116 as fast as it can be received from or provided to devices interconnected to the memory controller 104 through the first and second interfaces 108 and 112. Therefore, the interfaces 108 and 112 and devices interconnected to the interfaces 108

15 and 112 sometimes must wait while data is written to or read from the memory 116. For example, when the data written to the memory 116 is passed to a consumer of that data, the relatively low bandwidth of the memory 116 can result in data being passed to the consumer at a rate that is lower than the bandwidth at which the typical consumer or interface 108 or 112 is capable of receiving or passing that data. Therefore, the bandwidth or data rate of the

20 memory 116 ultimately determines the bandwidth of the memory control system 100.

With reference now to **Fig. 2**, a memory controller system 200 in accordance with an embodiment of the present invention is depicted. In general, the memory controller system

**200** includes a memory controller **204**, a first or host interface **208**, a second or channel interface **212**, and a memory **216**. The memory controller **204** may include a memory manager **220**, a first compression/decompression block or engine **224**, and a second compression/decompression block or engine **228**. In addition, the memory controller **204** 5 may include an uncompressed memory port **232**. In accordance with the embodiment illustrated in **Fig. 2**, the memory controller **204** is part of a memory controller system **200** interconnecting a peripheral device **236** to a host system **240**.

In a typical application, the memory controller system **200** of the present invention is provided as part of a peripheral device **236**, such as a computer storage device. For example, 10 the memory controller system **200** may be provided as part of a hard disk drive, a tape drive, an optical storage device, or any other type of bulk storage device. In addition, the memory controller system **200** may be provided as part of a redundant array of independent (or inexpensive) disks (RAID), or as a bridge between data busses.

According to one embodiment of the present invention, the memory controller **204** is 15 implemented as part of the memory controller system **200** in an ASIC controller included as part of a hard disk drive. The memory **216** is, according to one embodiment of the present invention, SDRAM. However, the memory **216** may include any type of memory, such as DRAM, SRAM, and RAM. Furthermore, the memory **216** may be external to other components of the memory controller system, or may be internal to another component. For 20 example, the memory **216** may be internal to an application specific integrated circuit (ASIC) implementing the functional blocks or components of the memory controller.

The interfaces **208** and **212** are generally determined by the type of communication

bus to be interfaced to the memory controller **204**. For example, where the first interface **208** interconnects the memory controller **204** to a host processor **244** and/or main memory **248**, provided as part of the host system **240** the first interface **208** will typically be required to communicate with a host system bus **252**. The host system bus **252** may include a  
5 peripheral component interconnect (PCI) bus. The first interface **208** may include a PCI, small computer system interface (SCSI), fiber channel, advanced technology attachment (ATA), serial ATA (SATA) or other interface to a communication bus. The second interface **212** may likewise include an SCSI, fiber channel, ATA, SATA, or other interface to a communication bus. Accordingly, it can be appreciated that the memory controller system  
10 **200** may be used to interconnect the communication busses of two different host systems, or to interconnect a host system to a peripheral device **248** or devices. Where the memory controller system **200** is implemented as part of a peripheral device **248** itself, such as a hard disk drive, the first **208** and/or second interface **212** may include the channel of the device.  
For example, where the memory controller system **200** is part of a hard disk drive, the  
15 second interface **212** may interconnect the memory controller **204** directly to the read/write channel of the hard disk drive, while the first interface **208** may interconnect the memory controller **204** to a communication bus such as a host system bus **252**.

The memory controller system **200** in accordance with an embodiment of the present invention may, like the conventional memory controller **100**, utilize memory **216** having a  
20 rated bandwidth or data rate that is about equal to or slightly greater than the combined bandwidths or data rates of the first **208** and second **212** interfaces, and less than the bandwidth or data rate of the memory manager **220**. In addition, the memory **216** has a

bandwidth that is less than the bandwidth or data rate of the first **224** and second **228** compression/decompression blocks or engines. Furthermore, the memory **216** used in connection with a memory controller system **200** in accordance with the present invention may have the same nominal bandwidth as the memory **116** used in connection with a conventional memory system controller **100**. However, the apparent bandwidth of the memory **216** provided in connection with an embodiment of the present invention is greater than the apparent bandwidth of the memory **116** associated with a conventional memory controller **100**.

The memory controller **204** of the present invention increases the apparent bandwidth of the memory **216** because data is generally written to and read from the memory **216** in compressed form. Because the compression of data reduces the number of bits in a block of data, less bandwidth is required to store or retrieve a sequence of compressed data than is required to store or retrieve the same sequence of data in uncompressed form in a given amount of time. Alternatively, a given amount of data can be stored in or retrieved from the memory **216** associated with the memory controller **204** of the present invention in less time than that same amount of data can be stored in or retrieved from memory **116** having the same characteristics of memory **216** but associated with a conventional memory controller **104**. Accordingly, by writing data to and reading data from the memory **216** in compressed form, the apparent bandwidth of the memory **216** is increased. In addition, because the bandwidth of the memory **116** in a conventional memory controller system **100** limits the data throughput performance (*i.e.* the bandwidth) of the controller system **100**, a memory controller system **200** in accordance with the present invention that increases the

apparent bandwidth of the memory **116** can provide improved bandwidth or data throughput performance. Accordingly, a memory controller system **200** in accordance with the present invention can utilize memory **216** having nominal performance characteristics that are identical to memory **116** used in connection with a conventional memory controller system **100**, while providing an increased data rate. Alternatively, a memory controller system **200** in accordance with the present invention can use memory **216** having a lower rated bandwidth than a conventional memory controller **100**, while providing a similar data rate.

With reference now to **Fig. 3**, a flow chart illustrating an example of the operation of an embodiment of the present invention is illustrated. Initially, at step **300**, a block of data is received at an interface **208** or **212**. For purposes of the present example, it will be assumed that the data is received at the first interface **208** for storage on a hard disk drive (peripheral device **236**) with which the memory controller **204** is integrated. Furthermore, it will be assumed that the source of the data is the host system **240**. After being received at the first interface **208**, the block of data is passed to the first compression/decompression engine **224**, and the block of data is compressed (step **304**).

The compressed block of data is then passed to the memory manager **220**. The memory manager **220** determines whether the block of data is larger in compressed form than it was in its original, uncompressed form (step **308**). If the data in compressed form is not larger than it was in its original, uncompressed form, the compressed block of data is written to the memory **216** (step **312**). If at step **308** it is determined that the compression of the data actually resulted in an expansion of that data, it is written to the memory **216** in uncompressed form (step **316**). Accordingly, it can be appreciated that the memory manager

220 detects pathological instances of data that cannot be compressed by the compression/decompression engines 224 and 228. Alternatively, the portion of the data expanded by the compression algorithm implemented by the compression/decompression engine 224 is written to the memory 216 in expanded form, and the remaining portion of the  
5 data is written to the memory 216 without being altered by the compression algorithm. As a further alternative, the expansion of the data can be ignored, and all of the data can be processed by the compression algorithm before it is written to the memory 216.

The data written to the memory 216 generally remains there until it is required at an interface 208 or 212 interconnected to a data consumer, or until the interface 208 or 212  
10 interconnected to the consumer of data is ready to accept that data. Accordingly, it can be appreciated that the memory 216 may be used to buffer data, or as a data cache.  
Accordingly, at step 320, a determination is made as to whether the block of data in memory 216 is required at an interface 208 or 212, or whether an interface 208 or 212 is ready to accept all or a portion of data stored in memory 216. If no, the system 200 may idle at step  
15 320. If yes, the block of data is read from the memory 216 (step 324).

At step 328, the block of data read from memory 216 is analyzed, for instance by the memory manager 220, to determine whether that data was compressed (step 328).  
Alternatively, the memory manager 220 may maintain a record of the data stored in memory 216 that includes an indication as to whether a particular portion of data written to the  
20 memory 216 has been compressed. The memory manager 220 may also be used to keep a record of the attributes, such as the address, compression status, (for example in the form of a compression flag), and length of data stored in the memory 216.

If the data read from memory **216** was compressed, that data is decompressed in the second compression/decompression engine **228** (step **332**). The block of data, in its original, uncompressed form, is then provided to the second interface **212** for delivery to the intended data consumer (step **336**). Thus, according to the present example, upon being provided to  
5 the second interface **212**, the block of data is stored on the hard disk drive **236** with which the memory controller **204** is associated in uncompressed form.

If the block of data read from memory **216** was not compressed, no step of decompression is required. Instead, the data may be passed from the memory manager **220** to the second interface **212** for storage on the hard disk drive **236** (the data consumer in this  
10 example) without a step of decompression by the second compression/decompression engine **228**. According to an embodiment of the present invention, a data compression flag is maintained by the memory manager **220** with respect to each block of data to indicate the compression status of the data. Therefore, depending on the status of the data compression flag, the memory manager can determine whether data should be decompressed in the  
15 second compression/decompression engine **228**.

As can be appreciated by one of skill in the art, in connection with a read operation, the steps set forth in **Fig. 3** are largely the same, except the data is received at the second interface **212** and passed to the first interface **208**. Accordingly, data received at the second interface **212** is compressed in the second compression/decompression engine **228**, and  
20 analyzed by the memory manager **220**. If the memory manager **220** determines that the compression operation has in fact expanded the data, the data is written to the memory **216** in uncompressed form. Otherwise, the data is written to the memory **216** in compressed

form. When the data is ready to be accepted at the first interface **208**, or has been requested, the memory manager **220** determines whether the data read from the memory **216** was compressed. If the data was compressed, it is decompressed by the first compression/decompression engine **224** and passed to the first interface **208**. Alternatively, 5 if the data stored in memory **216** was not compressed, for example because the memory manager **220** determined that it was pathological and had in fact expanded during an earlier attempted compression operation, it is passed to the first interface **208** without further modification by the first compressions/decompression engine **224**. Accordingly, it can be appreciated that data is passed from the first interface **208** of the memory controller system 10 **200** in uncompressed form. Furthermore, from the above description, it can be appreciated that any data read from the memory **216** in compressed form is decompressed before it is provided to an interface **208** or **212** for delivery to a data consumer.

Although the examples given above generally describe transfers of data between a peripheral device **236** interconnected to the second interface **212** and a host system **240** 15 interconnected to the first interface **208**, the operation of the controller **204** of the present invention is not limited to such situations. For example, both the first **208** and second **212** interfaces may be interconnected to peripheral devices or busses. Furthermore, it should be appreciated that data received at one of the interfaces **208** or **212** may be passed back to the same interface at which it was received, for example, in connection with a data cache 20 operation.

It should be appreciated that additional operations may be performed with respect to data passed through the memory controller **204** of the present invention. For example, parity

checking or error correction functions may be performed, such as when the memory controller **204** is implemented as part of a device controller, including a RAID controller. For instance, a cyclical redundancy check (CRC) operation may be performed with respect to data to provide parity or error correction information. Such parity or error correction  
5 information may be passed to a consumer of the data along with the data itself, or may be used for internal error detection or error correction purposes.

The uncompressed port **232** that may be provided as part of the memory controller **204** is generally used for internal functions. For example, the uncompressed port **232** may allow the processor implementing all or part of the memory controller **204** to access the  
10 memory **216**. For instance, the memory controller **204** may store scratch data and other information generated in the memory **216** through the uncompressed port **232**. According to another embodiment of the present invention, the uncompressed port **232** may be interconnected to one or both of the interfaces **208** or **212** when data compression and decompression are not desired.

15 In an embodiment of the memory controller system **200** provided in connection with a hard disk drive, the memory **216** may be about 4 Megabytes of SDRAM having a bandwidth of 100 Megabytes per second. The first interface **208** may comprise an ATA, SATA, or SCSI interface interconnecting the memory controller system **200** to the host system **240**. The bandwidth of the host system may be about 100 Megabytes per second.  
20 The memory controller **204** may be implemented as part of an ASIC controller that is itself included as part of a hard disk drive. That is, the memory controller system **204** may be part of a peripheral device **136**. The second interface **212** may thus interconnect the memory

controller **204** to the read/write channel of the hard disk drive. Accordingly, the second or channel interface **212** may be a proprietary host or CPU interface used in connection with read/write operations to a disk included as part of the disk drive.

The application specific integrated circuit (ASIC) implementing the functions of the  
5 memory controller **204** may include a processor that is generally capable of running software, firmware or microcode implementing the compression/decompression blocks **224** and **228**, the memory manager **220**, and, if provided, the uncompressed port **232**. In particular, the ASIC or processor implementing the memory controller **204** must be capable  
10 of compressing and decompressing data at a rate greater than the actual bandwidth of the memory **216**.

The various components depicted in the memory controller **204** illustrate major functional aspects of the controller **204**, and not necessarily discrete pieces of hardware. For example, it can be appreciated by one of skill in the art that the memory manager **220**, the first **224** and second **228** compression/decompression engines, and the uncompressed port  
15 (*i.e.* the major functional components of the memory controller **204**) may all be implemented as part of a suitable ASIC or programmable processor. Furthermore, it will be appreciated by one of skill in the art that various subcombinations of the functional components of the memory controller **204** may be embodied in separate programmable processors or in a combination of one or more programmable processors and one or more hardware engines.  
20 For example, the compression/decompression engines **224** and **228** may be implemented as hardware compression and decompression engines. As a further example, a single hardware compression engine may be provided to perform the compression function of both block **224**

and block **228**. Similarly, a single hardware decompression engine may be provided to perform the decompression functions of both block **224** and block **228**. Hardware engines used to implement the compression/ decompression blocks **224** and **228** must be capable of compressing and decompressing data at a rate greater than the actual bandwidth of the

5 memory **216**.

It should be appreciated that the memory manager **220** may perform a variety of

functions. For example, as explained above, the memory manager **220** can determine

whether data is capable of being compressed. In addition, the memory manager **220** can

maintain a record of the data stored in memory **216** to allow the efficient retrieval of all or

10 portions of that data in response to a request for such data. The memory manager **220** may

also control the reading and decompression of data to a temporary data buffer in response to

a request for random access to the compressed data received at an interface **208** or **212**.

The compression/decompression blocks **224** and **228**, as can be appreciated by one of ordinary skill in the art, may be implemented using a single compression and complimentary

15 decompression routine. Any lossless compression algorithm may be used. In accordance

with one embodiment of the present invention, the Lempel-Ziv-Welch (LZW) algorithm is

used. In general, a compression algorithm is suitable for use in connection with the memory

controller **204** of the present invention so long as it is capable of performing compression

and subsequent decompression of data without loss of information.

20 As can be appreciated by the above description, in normal operation the memory

controller **204** compresses all data received at either of the first **208** or second **212** interfaces.

Provided that the data is not pathological, and has not been expanded by the compression

algorithm, it is stored in the memory **216** in compressed form. Furthermore, it can be appreciated that data is passed from the memory controller system **200** in uncompressed form. Accordingly, data stored in memory **216** in compressed format is decompressed prior to being passed to a consumer of that data, such as a host processor **244** or a peripheral device **236**. Therefore, it can be appreciated that the memory controller **204** of the present invention is capable of providing increased data throughput as compared to a conventional memory controller having memory with a comparable bandwidth. For example, if a 2:1 compression ratio is achieved by the first **224** and second **228** compression/decompression blocks, the amount of data that must be stored in the memory **216** is, including overhead, about half as much as the amount of data that would have to be stored in the memory **216** without data compression. Accordingly, the time required to write the compressed block of data to the memory **216** and to retrieve that data from the memory **216** is about half what it would be if the data were not compressed. In addition, it should be appreciated that the memory controller **204** of the present invention does not increase the absolute memory bandwidth of the system bus **252**, or any other bus, interconnected to the memory controller system **200**.

Also, it can be appreciated that the memory controller system **200** of the present invention is transparent to any associated host processor **244**. Therefore, the memory controller system **200** of the present invention can be implemented in connection with conventional host systems **240** to provide increased data throughput, for example, to and from a peripheral device **236**, such as a hard disk drive, without requiring host processor **244** resources or modification to the host system **240**. Furthermore, it can be appreciated that the

memory controller system **200** may be provided as an integral part of a peripheral device **236**, such as a hard disk drive or other mass storage device. In addition, the memory controller system **200** of the present invention may be implemented as part of RAID controller.

5           The foregoing discussion of the invention has been presented for purposes of illustration and description. Further, the description is not intended to limit the invention to the form disclosed herein. Consequently, variations and modifications commensurate with the above teachings, within the skill and knowledge of the relevant art, are within the scope of the present invention. The embodiments described hereinabove are further intended to 10 explain the best mode presently known of practicing the invention and to enable others skilled in the art to utilize the invention in such or in other embodiments and with various modifications required by their particular application or use of the invention. It is intended that the appended claims be construed to include the alternative embodiments to the extent permitted by the prior art.